

Graduate & Postdoctoral Studies

Office of the Vice-Provost and Dean Yeates School of Graduate & Postdoctoral Studies

Final Assessment Report (FAR) and Implementation Plan

Periodic Program Review (PPR)

Graduate Program in Computer Science (MSc, PhD)

Last Updated: May 8, 2024

FINAL ASSESSMENT REPORT

In accordance with the University Institutional Quality Assurance Process (IQAP), this final assessment report provides a synthesis of the external evaluation and the internal response and assessments of the graduate program in **Computer Science (MSc, PhD).** This report identifies the peer review identified strengths of the program, together with opportunities for program improvement and enhancement, and it sets out and prioritizes the recommendations that have been selected for implementation.

The report also includes an Implementation Plan that identifies who will be responsible for approving the recommendations set out in the final assessment report; who will be responsible for providing any resources entailed by those recommendations; any changes in organization, policy or governance that will be necessary to meet the recommendations and who will be responsible for acting on those recommendations; and timelines for acting on and monitoring the implementation of those recommendations.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

TMU's Graduate Programs in Computer Science offer two degrees: a Master of Science (M.Sc.) and a Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D.). These programs are for graduate students seeking advanced education in Computer Science research and advanced concepts.

The Masters program took in its first students in 2007 with the Doctoral program beginning in 2011. The Program graduate students are supported by 27 faculty members, 5 adjunct faculty members and 24 associated members.¹ Three technical staff provide day to day support over that provided by the University.² In addition, 4 non-technical staff provide administrative support. There is one Graduate Program Director (GPD) responsible for academic matters in the graduate programs who is assisted by a Graduate Program Administrator (GPA) who handles all administrative matters.

The employment outlook for all graduates with a Computer Science degree of any kind is well above average. 65 percent of the fastest-growing and 62 percent of the highest-paying skills in the 5 fastest growing fields are computer science-related.

¹ A list of members of the TMU graduate school associated with the graduate programs in Computer Science is maintained at: https://www.torontomu.ca/graduate/faculty-staff/. Last accessed February 16, 2021.

² TMU provides computing and communication support through the "Computing and Communications Services (CCS) organization. Information about the wide list of services can be found at: https://www.toronotmu.ca/ccs/. Last accessed February 16, 2021.

According to our alumni survey, 93.3% percent of all respondents indicated that they were employed or pursuing additional education. Of the respondents that indicated that they were employed, 99.6% of those indicating they were employed indicated that they were employed as computer scientists or in a closely related field.

A total of 31 students have successfully completed their PhD degrees and a total of 214 students have successfully completed their M.Sc. degree as of the date of this report.

Clearly our programs have been successful in preparing graduates for both continued graduate studies and for relevant careers and other employment opportunities in Computer Science. The programs, supported by the interests of an engaged faculty complement, has a heavy emphasis on applied research. This turns out to create graduates that are very much in demand.

Despite these strengths, the programs do face a number of challenges going forward. Student financial support has been an issue. Levels of stipend support for M.Sc. and Ph.D. students vary widely across the program. The inability to offer multi-year guaranteed funding packages is also a concern, particularly for Ph.D. students. A hidden problem also looms. Because of the demand by students for competent Computer Science Education, the Department of Computer Science has been asked to take on ever greater numbers of undergraduates with a competent growth in faculty members who want ever-more graduate students to participate in their research agendas. This situation is problematic because the number of domestic graduate students our programs can accept is limited to a fixed number as the total number of domestic graduate students within all graduate programs are controlled by targets set at the YSGPS level to ensure that the University does not surpass the number of funded graduate spots. As there are no new funded positions being allocated, in order for CS graduate programs to grow, they would require reallocation of existing domestic graduate spots from other graduate programs in the Faculty of Science or — even less likely--from other programs at the University as a whole . For the most part our graduate programs have had little trouble in achieving our domestic graduate intake targets. While improving the experience of the lucky few students who can participate in our programs is a laudable goal, it will not address this structural problem.

Graduate programs in Computer Science are well positioned for continued success in the coming years. The program has many talented faculty members and students with strong research productivity. Student satisfaction is generally high and employment prospects are excellent.³

³ Relevant data is presented throughout the Computer Science self-study report.

PERIODIC PROGRAM REVIEW AND PEER REVIEW TEAM

The graduate program in **Computer Science (MSc, PhD),** FOS, submitted a Self-Study Report to the Yeates School of Graduate & Postdoctoral Studies that outlined program descriptions and learning outcomes, an analytical assessment of the program, program data including data from student surveys and the standard data packages. Course outlines and CVs for full-time faculty members were also appended.

Two external and one internal arm's-length reviewers were selected from a set of proposed candidates. The Peer Review Team (PRT) for the Periodic Program Review (PPR) of this graduate program consisted of Dr. Graeme Hirst, Department of Computer Science, University of Toronto; Dr Hosam El-Ocla, Department of Computer Science, Lakehead University; and Dr. Kimberly Bates, Ted Rogers School of Management, Toronto Metropolitan University.

The PRT site visit was conducted on-site on November 15, 2023. The visit included interviews with the University and Faculty Administration including the Provost and Vice-President Academic, Faculty Dean, Faculty Associate Dean, Vice-Provost and Dean Yeates School of Graduate & Postdoctoral Studies (YSGPS); Associate Dean Programs YSGPS, Graduate Program Director of the Graduate Program, Director Graduate Program Administration, and meetings with Faculty, a group of current students, administration, and support staff. The PRT report was communicated to the Associate Dean, YSGPS on March 17, 2024. The response to the report from the graduate program and Faculty Dean was communicated on April 1, 2024, and the final response was provided on April 9, 2024. The responses of the Program, Faculty Dean, and the YSGPS were revised after feedback received during the meeting of the Priorities and Planning Committee (PPC) on April 16, 2024. This response reflects those revisions.

PROGRAM STRENGTHS, WEAKNESSES, AND OPPORTUNITIES

The PRT cited some strengths of, and opportunities for, this graduate program including the program having some good faculty members and good basic facilities, citing that the framework of a good program is present and with adequate funding, it could become far stronger. For instance, The PRT noted the "enthusiasm of the faculty in delivering the curriculum and the dedication and competence of the support staff." The PRT was also pleased with centres of research excellence in some labs that also serve as hubs for applied as well as fundamental research while at the same time creating suitable environments for the training of graduate students. The PRT noted evidence of student engagement and community building through the labs.

SUMMARY OF PRT RECOMMENDATIONS, GRADUATE PROGRAM AND YSGPS RESPONSES, AND IMPLEMENTATION PLAN

A report on the progress of these initiatives will be provided in the Follow-up Report which will be due in one year from the date of Senate approval.

PRT Recommendations	Computer Science Program Response	Dean of Faculty of Science Response	Proposed Program Action	Program Timeline and Responsibility/Lead	YSGPS Response
Recommendation 1. The PRT recommends that the programs raise admissions standards, and take steps to improve the quality of the applicant pool so that this can be done without lowering the number of admissions.	The Program follows the practice of holistic admissions as a matter of equity restoration and access to opportunities. In fact, the Programs have been using such an approach for many years as the Programs finds that taking into account other aspects of an applicant's life creates a much better fit in our Programs. Respectfully, our admission processes find qualified candidates to participate in our programs. Our Program's graduation rates are similar to those of other graduate programs at the University. We do use CGPA as one of several criteria considered in the admissions process. Our intent is to educate students who select our Programs who would benefit from a solid graduate education in Computer Science.	The Faculty of Science agrees with the program, that current admission practices are matriculating good students.	Not applicable	Not applicable	The YSGPS commends the Program on its holistic approach to reviewing applications. This approach does not mean lowered admission standards and it should result in an improved quality of students being admitted.

PRT Recommendations	Computer Science Program	Dean of Faculty of Science	Proposed Program	Program Timeline and	YSGPS Response
	Response	Response	Action	Responsibility/Lead	
	applicants and raising our				
	standards.				
Recommendation 2. The PRT recommends that the department be proactive in recruitment of high-quality domestic students.	The Department of Computer Science plays an important role in recruiting domestic students through funding poster and social media campaigns. These efforts are supplemented by The Faculty of Science who maintains a marketing and communications team. This approach has allowed our Programs to consistently meet or surpass admissions targets in most years. The Programs, however, agree that	The Faculty of Science applauds the program's efforts to cost-effectively promote itself through posters and social media and will do what it can to further support and improve the visibility of the program through our Marketing and Communications team.	The Programs will explore and discuss additional strategies that can be used in order to recruit high- quality domestic applicants.	The Programs will initiate discussions with the Department and the Dean's Office this year (2024).	The YSGPS commends the Program in its current recruitment efforts and planned discussion with the Faculty of Science Dean's Office to explore additional strategies. YSGPS is happy to be involved in these discussions and provide support where it can.
	available for recruitment.				
Recommendation 3. The PRT recommends that the number of graduate courses offered each year be increased, possibly in part by more extensive cross-listing as well as by growth in faculty numbers.	The Programs agree with this recommendation to an extent. Indeed, the Programs provide a large number of cross- listed courses available to our students and will seek to continue this practice where possible and resources allow.	The Faculty of Science supports efforts to cross-list graduate courses between Computer Science and other programs within FOS and other faculties, wherever it makes sense to do so. It also encourages the Computer Science department to consider the potential for creation of new graduate courses and improving the	The Programs will discuss students' course needs, structuring, and strategies for planning course offerings as far in advance as logistically possible.	The Programs will initiate discussions with the Department this year (2024).	The YSGPS supports the efforts of the Program and the Faculty of Science to explore various means by which to increase the number of graduate courses offered each year and is available to consult on proposed major and minor curriculum modifications.

PRT Recommendations	Computer Science Program	Dean of Faculty of Science	Proposed Program	Program Timeline and	YSGPS Response
	Response	Response	Action	Responsibility/Lead	
		(see recommendation 4)			
		through its allocated new			
		faculty hires.			
		The faculty will support the			
		creation and offering of			
		additional courses in cases for			
		which it makes good economic			
		sense to do so.			
Recommendation 4.	The Programs agree that there are	The Computer Science	The Programs will	The Programs will	The YSGPS supports the efforts of the
	far too many artificial intelligence	department is allocated	explore how we	initiate discussions	Program and the Faculty of Science to
The PRT recommends that the	and machine learning	several new faculty hires in	might offer a wider	with the Department	explore various means by which to offer
department diversify its course	courses. However, there is a very	the coming years, and is	range of courses.	this year (2024) and	new graduate courses and is available to
offerings, and that the need for	large demand for such courses	encouraged to consider how	The Programs will	encourage faculty	consult on proposed major and minor
much broader coverage of	from our (and several other)	this growth can broaden the	discuss course	members to create	curriculum modifications.
computer science should be an	programs. The programs will seek	coverage of Computer Science	options with	new courses as quickly	
important consideration in	to increase the number of non-Al	subfields in the graduate	students.	as possible. As a	
futuro hiring	related courses available including	programs as part of its hiring	The Programs will	comment, much of	
luture millig.	those that speak to the increasing	strategy.	encourage faculty	this planning will rely	
	challenges in social and ethical		to create new	on an increase in	
	computation.		courses.	program funding	
			The Department	largely out of the	
	Providing coverage for the growing		will consider	control of both the	
	subfields within Computer Science		diverse expertise	Programs and the	
	has been a challenge for the		that may support	Department.	
	Programs given that until relatively		relevant		
	recently no faculty hiring had been		new courses when		
	taking place. Over time sustained		hiring.		
	commitment to hiring faculty				
	members with more diverse				

PRT Recommendations	Computer Science Program	Dean of Faculty of Science	Proposed Program	Program Timeline and	YSGPS Response
	Response	Response	Action	Responsibility/Lead	
Recommendation 5. The PRT recommends that core courses be offered every year.	interests and expertise will allow us to better address this recommendation in the future. The PRT was provided with data from the time-period specified by YSGPS which would only include data from the 8-year period associated with the PPR. At that time there were fewer courses available. This has since been partially rectified and will continue to be a focus for the Programs as sustained commitment to hiring new faculty members continues.	With the suggested removal of CP9101 from the core curriculum of the Computer Science PhD program (recommendation 9, below) there will be no core subject courses in the program (aside from seminar, etc.). This recommendation seems to be more about introducing more subfield- related courses, which makes sense in the context of new faculty hires with expertise in those subfields.	The Programs will continue to hold discussions with and survey students, faculty, and graduate committees. Depending on the scope of approved recommendations, modifications will be implemented accordingly.	The Programs have begun to implement this recommendation and will continue discussions with the Department, faculty, and graduate students this year (2024). Depending on the scope of proposed modifications, revisions will be implemented according to relevant policies. Substantial modifications will be discussed with the Faculty of Science Dean's offices	The YSGPS supports the Program's plan to update its curriculum as desired after consultation with key stakeholders and is available to provide advice regarding proposed major or minor modifications of this nature. YSGPS notes that the program was provided additional data by YSGPS on course loading and enrollments during 2018-2023, covering the period after the official review period (2010-2018). It is not clear why this data was not provided to the PRT as recommended by YSGPS.
Recommendation 6/7.	The Programs agree that breadth is important. The PhD program	As the Computer Science	The Programs will initiate and hold	The Programs will	The YSGPS supports the Program's plan
The PRT recommends that	currently has a "breadth"	most part research-based it	discussions with	with the Department	consultation with key stakeholders and is
breadth requirements be added	requirement but only recognized 2	makes sense for students to	and survey our	faculty and graduate	available to provide advice regarding
to both the MSc and PhD	sub-fields and all courses are	develop denth of knowledge	students faculty	students this year	proposed major or minor modifications of
programs in the not-too-distant	(sometimes arbitrarily) assigned to	in specialized areas related to	and graduate	(2024)	this nature. It also notes that our
	one of the two. Therefore, we are	their research, rather than	committees.	Depending on the	Graduate Degree Level Expectations as

PRT Recommendations	Computer Science Program	Dean of Faculty of Science	Proposed Program	Program Timeline and	YSGPS Response
	Response	Response	Action	Responsibility/Lead	
<u></u>					
future as more courses start to	currently constrained by history in	breadth of knowledge. As the	Depending on the	scope of proposed	defined in Policy 110 require learning
be offered.	our ability to offer a sufficient	faculty complement grows	scope of approved	modifications,	outcomes that cover both breadth and
	variety of courses to support this	and expands into new areas,	recommendations,	revisions will	depth of knowledge.
	recommendation. The Programs	we expect that will afford the	modifications will	be implemented	
(NB: this recommendation	will continue to add graduate	opportunity to deliver a wider	be	according to relevant	
appears twice in the PRT report)	courses from different sub-fields of	breadth for students.	implemented accor	policies. Substantial	
	Computer Science as expertise is		dingly.	modifications will be	
	built up over time as hiring			discussed with the	
	continues.			Faculty of Science	
				Dean's offices.	
Recommendation 8.	As previously stated, this is already	There are practical limitations	No action required	No action required on	YSGPS agrees with the responses but
The PPT recommends that	the practice within the Programs.	to this approach, since it can	by the Programs.	the part of the	notes that recommendation 3 above
cross listing of graduate courses	Approximately ⁴ / ₃ of the grad	create problems for graduate		Programs.	seems to be about cross listing between
with fourth year undergraduate	courses offered in 2024/25 are	students who completed their			graduate programs while this
sources be introduced wherever	cross-listed with undergraduate	BSc degrees at TMU and have			recommendation is about cross listing
course material permits	courses. However there will always	already completed the cross			with 4 th year undergraduate courses. We
which it should do in many	be graduate courses offered at a	listed courses. The extent to			also note that no more than one third of
cases	level that would be too	which this is already the			courses taken by a graduate student can
Cases.	sophisticated to be so offered.	practice in the program is			be cross listed with an undergraduate
		likely at that practical limit.			program.
Recommendation 9.	The Programs' current practice	The PRT likely got the wrong	No action required	Ongoing discussion at	The YSGPS is available to consult on best
The DBT recommends that a	aligns with this	impression about this, as	by the Programs.	regular FOS GPD	practices and clarifying Senate policies
more formal checkpoint system	recommendation. We have	regular progress reports, and		meetings.	related to student progress reports and
he implemented for the PhD	mandatory documented progress	supervisory committee			supervisory committee meetings, as well
program Each student should	reviews for all graduate students	meetings are the current			as provide GPDs with additional
baye a continuing committee	which is already 3x more often	practice. Nevertheless, the			information or clarification, in support of
whose members the student	than what is suggested by Senate	FOS AD and GPDs will			Faculty efforts.
can draw on for advice at any	policy.	regularly discuss best practices			
time and each student should		to ensure that these			YSGPS notes that policy 170(b) is under
be required to most with their					revision where the role of the Plan of
be required to meet with their					

PRT Recommendations	Computer Science Program	Dean of Faculty of Science	Proposed Program	Program Timeline and	YSGPS Response
	Response	Response	Action	Responsibility/Lead	
PRT Recommendationscommittee at least once per year, if not for an exam or other formal event then at least for a progress report.Recommendation 10.The PRT recommends that training for teaching assistants be improved, but CP9101 should be discontinued and removed from the PhD program	Computer Science Program Response All students within the Doctoral program must have supervisory committees involved in the review of regular progress reports at least three time per year of enrolment. TA/GA positions at TMU are unionized. Training is available on a voluntary basis from the Faculty of Science and the Centre of Excellence in Teaching and Learning. Taking training is encouraged, however, training is	Dean of Faculty of Science Response checkpoints happen regularly and as scheduled. The Faculty of Science supports the change of CP9101 from the core curriculum for PhD, to elective available to all Computer Science graduate students. Moreover, starting	Proposed Program Action The Programs will continue to encourage the Department to continue to encourage the CS graduate	Program Timeline and Responsibility/Lead The Programs will initiate action this year (2024) to undertake modifications of the programs, making CP9101 an elective for all CS	YSGPS Response Study, Progress Reviews, and Supervisory Committees in monitoring the progress of Doctoral students is further clarified. The YSGPS supports the Program and Faculty responses to this recommendation and commends the proposed actions to enhance TAGA training opportunities.
removed from the PhD program requirements.	is encouraged, however, training is not mandatory. The Programs will continue to encourage graduate students to learn pedagogy and apply it.	students. Moreover, starting in F2024, TAGA contracts will include a paid 2-hour workshop at the beginning of the semester to improve TAGA consistency	graduate students interested in TA/GA positions to seek training. The Programs will seek to make	elective for all CS graduate students.	
	CP9101 explicitly addresses the needs of teaching Computer Science to undergraduate students. The Programs agree that in its current form the course is not	and the quality of work for them, and the quality of support for undergraduates.	CP9101 an elective available to all CS graduate students.		
	available often enough and to too few types of graduate students. It is the intent of the Programs to make this course available to all CS graduate students as an elective. Indeed it has been the goal of the Programs to make this course an				
	elective for some time.				

PRT Recommendations	Computer Science Program	Dean of Faculty of Science	Proposed Program	Program Timeline and	YSGPS Response
	Response	Response	Action	Responsibility/Lead	
Recommendation 11. The PRT recommends that, in order to foster greater student engagement, the seminar series be broadened into a more- general graduate student event with food and social and/or other academic activities.	The Programs agree with this recommendation. The Programs will seek to open the seminar course to all graduate students and provide nutritional incentives to attend. We will continue to explore ways to attract more participation.	The Faculty of Science supports a revamp of the Computer Science seminar course. The FOS AD and GPDs will discuss each program's current practices with respect to seminar courses, to help arrive at the best suggestions for Computer Science as well as other FOS graduate programs	The Programs will seek to modify the existing doctoral seminar course by renaming it to simply "Graduate Seminar" and making it a mandatory part of each thesis-based program.	The Programs will seek to implement this change in 2024 through the regular program modification processe s.	The YSGPS supports the Program's plan to update its curriculum and is available to provide advice regarding proposed major or minor modifications of this nature.
Recommendation 12. The PRT recommends that the graduate student stipend be very substantially increased — \$20,000 per year would not be unreasonable — and that the university grant a waiver of the international fee differential so that international students can be admitted to the program on the same financial terms as domestic students.	The Programs agree with this recommendation although this recommendation is largely out of the Programs' control. The Programs encourage the University to make serious investments to support both domestic and international graduate students.	At the faculty level, we are developing plans to ensure that TAship and supervisor grant support funding are administered as fairly and consistently as possible. Even with these measures, we agree that current take-home remuneration for graduate students (especially after tuition) is not enough.	The Programs will continue to lobby and advocate for substantially improved funding for both students and program administr ation.	Ongoing. Timeline out of the Programs' control.	YSGPS notes that "stipends" are typically paid from faculty member's research grant, and as such, this is outside of its purview. However, it will continue to support efforts and initiatives to increase funding for graduate student awards and scholarships. It should be noted that such funding has increased over the past several years through the addition of funding for 4 th year doctoral students, the introduction of TMGS scholarships, and the new international tuition revenue sharing model. YSGPS encourages the program and Faculty to look at the international revenue sharing model as a way towards tuition equalization for international graduate students.
Recommendation 13.	YSGPS maintains and list of	At the faculty level, we will explore ways to increase the	No action required.	Not applicable	The YSGPS supports the Program and Faculty responses to this

PRT Recommendations	Computer Science Program	Dean of Faculty of Science	Proposed Program	Program Timeline and	YSGPS Response
	Response	Response	Action	Responsibility/Lead	
The PRT recommends that the department graduate office maintain a list of scholarship opportunities for graduate students, publicizes the lists well, reminds students of application deadlines well in advance, and assists eligible students to make strong applications.	available funding opportunities of many kinds. The Programs regularly send out reminder emails to students that they should apply. Indeed, the success rates of graduate Computer Science students in winning funding is very good.	visibility of upcoming scholarship application deadlines, as well as continually improve our annual scholarship workshop.			recommendation to ensure that students maximize their opportunities to apply for and receive scholarships.
Recommendation 14. The PRT recommends re- evaluation of the allocation of space in the department, and, in particular, the creation of more office space and common space.	The Programs agree. Indeed, the department of Computer Science has opened up additional graduate student shared office space.	The Faculty of Science notes that while due to recently renovated space available in the Atrium on Bay, there is potential space for Computer Science which currently seems to be underutilized. The Faculty of Science continues to work with the University to develop more and better space for our operations. However, given the "pause" on the construction of a new FoS building, this type of solution will be temporary at best.	The Programs will continue to lobby and advocate for substantially increa sed space as it is required.	Not applicable	Such resource-related matters are outside the purview of the YSGPS, but it will continue to support efforts and initiatives that ensure appropriate infrastructure for graduate students.
Recommendation 15.	While the Programs whole heartedly agree with this	This recommendation seems to be outside the scope of the	Not applicable	Not applicable	Such resource-related matters are outside the purview of the YSGPS.
	recommendation, the				

PRT Recommendations	Computer Science Program Response	Dean of Faculty of Science Response	Proposed Program Action	Program Timeline and Responsibility/Lead	YSGPS Response
The PRT recommends that the department be granted funds to install proper cooling in the server room.	recommendation is beyond the scope of the Programs to implement.	periodic program review for the Computer Science graduate programs.			
Recommendation 16. The PRT recommends that the Graduate Program Director be given (at least) a two-course teaching reduction each year, and that support staff be augmented with (at least) another part-time position — possibly as one component of a full-time position with other duties.	The Programs agree with this recommendation. Indeed, all GPDs were once provided with 2 course releases.	The course release for GPDs is standard across the university, set by the VPFA, and outside the control of FOS. The administrative support for the graduate program (and the faculty and departments as a whole) was assessed by an outside consultant in later 2021 and found to be adequate at that time.	No action required on the part of the Program.	Ongoing	This particular recommendation is outside of the purview of the YSGPS as GPD release is negotiated with the Program's home Faculty or School (with the exception of the interdisciplinary graduate programs that are housed in the YSGPS).
Recommendation 17. The PRT recommends that the graduate program be given a budget at the discretion of the Graduate Program Director of perhaps \$10,000/year for graduate student facilities, events and engagement, and travel.	The Programs agree with this recommendation which was the practice for years for all graduate programs in the Faculty of Science.	The graduate programs receive a budget from FOS in the amount of \$3000 per fundable graduate student (up to 2nd year domestic MSc and up to 4th year domestic PhD), which can be used for any reasonable program expense.	The Programs will encourage the Dean of Science to act on this recommendation.	Advocacy for the restoration of an administrative budget for the Programs continues.	Such resource-related matters are outside the purview of the YSGPS; however, we encourage the program and the Dean's Office to come to a clear understanding about what is needed and what is available. Note that the Toronto Metropolitan University Graduate Student Travel Fund is also available to support graduate students in presenting their research at a regional, national or international conference or equivalent academic

PRT Recommendations	Computer Science Program	Dean of Faculty of Science	Proposed Program	Program Timeline and	YSGPS Response
	Response	Response	Action	Responsibility/Lead	
					event. This initiative is funded by the President's Office, the Office of Vice President Research and Innovation, and the YSGPS.
Recommendation 18. The PRT recommends that subsidizing student travel to conferences at which they have papers accepted should be a high priority, and ideally would have a budget of perhaps \$10,000/year separate from other discretionary program spending.	This recommendation is already current practice within our Programs. The Programs offer a "Peer-Reviewed Accepted Paper Encouragement Reward (PAPER)" program, available to our graduate students to subsidize publication and travel expenses. The budget for this program is funded by the Department of Computer Science who have made a total of \$20,000 per year available.	See comment in recommendation 16 above.	No action required	Not applicable	The YSGPS supports the Program and Faculty responses to this recommendation (please also see response to preceding recommendation).
Recommendation 19. The PRT recommends that the Library's budget for Computer Science materials be increased so that the current collection can be retained, and perhaps even expanded.	The Programs definitely agree with this recommendation for reasons that go beyond the Programs themselves. CS graduate students are very active participants in Library initiatives (like the "Collaboratory") and make extensive use of expensive Computer Science-related literature provided by our Library.	The Faculty of Science encourages the programs and the department to engage with the TMU Library subject librarian to see what can be done.	The Programs will continue to lobby and advocate for additional funding for TMU's Library.	Ongoing	Such resource-related matters are outside the purview of the YSGPS, but it will continue to support efforts and initiatives that ensure appropriate library reserves and other materials for graduate students.
Recommendation 20. The PRT recommends that the effects of any increase in the size of the undergraduate	The Programs agree with this recommendation. However, the recommendation is beyond the ability of the Programs to	The Faculty of Science agrees in principle, noting the limitations imposed upon us by the Strategic Mandate	The Programs will identify realized and anticipated ramific	The Department will discuss their concerns and needs with the Dean of Science and	The YSGPS will continue to coordinate with other key Toronto Metropolitan University offices to grow our graduate

PRT Recommendations	Computer Science Program	Dean of Faculty of Science	Proposed Program	Program Timeline and	YSGPS Response
	Response	Response	Action	Responsibility/Lead	
program, or the size of the	implement without increased	Agreement with the provincial	ations of the	YSGPS. It is	programs as needed so these reflect
faculty, must be paired with a	allocations of domestic graduate	government.	undergraduate	understood that this	changing circumstances and priorities.
corresponding increase in the	student spaces as well as funding		program growth on	will require	
size of the graduate program.	(or other subsidies for international		the graduate	considerable	
	students).		program.	university-wide	
			The Programs will	discussions and	
			consult and seek	strategizing in the	
			support to balance	coming years.	
			or integrate		
			undergraduate pro		
			gram growth with		
			graduate		
			infrastructure.		